Exporting violations

An outlook on the status of exporting light weapons from the Czech Republic to Egypt
Exporting violations

An outlook on the status of exporting light weapons from the Czech Republic to Egypt

EGYPTIAN FRONT FOR HUMAN RIGHTS
Exporting violations
An outlook on the status of exporting light weapons from the Czech Republic to Egypt

A report by
Egyptian Front for Human Rights

www.egyptianfront.org
info@egyptianfront.org
Kounicova 42, Brno, 60200,
Czech Republic

+420 773 213 198

All printing and publication rights reserved
under Creative Commons license 4.0
https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/

October, 2019
“Member States are determined to prevent the export of military technology and equipment which might be used for internal repression or international aggression or contribute to regional instability.”

Article 4
COUNCIL UNIFIED POSITION 2008/944/CFSP
Defining common rules governing control of exports of military technology and equipment
An Executive Summary

By the end of January 2016, a joint meeting took place between Egypt’s Military Production Minister Mohamed Saeed El-Assar, Czech Foreign Minister and a number of Czech defence companies where El-Assar confirmed that “the Czech Republic will not halt its weapon exports to Egypt like other European countries did after June 30, 2013.” The minister was referring to decisions by the European Union Institutions which indicated the prohibition of exporting military equipment to Egypt in the wake of the heightened oppressive acts and horrifying violations that the authorities committed against the opposition, the most violent of which were the dispersal of Rabaa and Nahda sit-ins on August 14, 2013. The report has documented the security forces’ use of Czech arms during the dispersal.

The Czech Republic, despite being a signatory to the Arms Trade Treaty and belonging to the European Union Council that has a unified position on prohibiting the export of arms to countries violating human rights, continues to arm the Egyptian security forces with varying light weapons, which have amounted to more than 41 million Euros in 2016. Regardless of accusations of committing massive and widespread violations directed at the Egyptian government. The authorities, inclusive of current President AbdelFattah ELSisi, always justifies its oppressive practices under the pretext of its war on terror.

The Czech arms come at a higher price for citizens as it is directly used in rights violations, even though its financial cost is considerably lower than heavy weaponry, which raises several questions regarding the nature of this export. What is its exact magnitude? What is the most comprehensive legal framework for the export process and how does the Egyptian authorities use

---

1 Al Hayat TV Channel, «Al Hayat Al Youm - Minister of Military Production | The Czech Republic stood next to Egypt on 30 June and there are strong relations between the two countries», YouTube Video, 31 January 2016, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=L_qm-tuzPvw
2 refer to the third section of the report
The report aims at answering these questions and others through four sections. The first section highlights the most prominent violations committed by the security forces against Egyptians, on top of which are extrajudicial killings, where it is suspected that the Czech arms had been used in its implementation. The second section features the legal framework for the Czech Republic’s export of weapons, on both local and international fronts, and what this framework imposes from mandatory verification that they won’t be used in acts of oppression or violating human rights by the importing country. The third section exposes the nature of the relation between the Czech Republic and the Egyptian authorities. It looks into the export figures from the Czech Republic to Egypt and its progress since July 2013, while the fourth section manifests that the Egyptian security forces, headed by the interior ministry, have used Czech weapons in what is reckoned to be internal acts of repression, adding to attempts of reinforcing these weapons by obtaining a licence to manufacture some of them inside Egypt.

This report relied on monitoring figures provided in annual reports by Czech’s ministry of industry and trade as well as reports issued by both Egyptian and International human rights organizations, in addition to an analysis of videos issued by Egypt’s interior ministry official page and other media platforms.

The report proposes a number of recommendations, primarily to the Egyptian government which must respect the principles of human rights stipulated in international conventions and also an immediate suspension of all rights violations under the pretext of the war on terror. The report also demands that the Czech Republic halts its export of light weapons to Egypt, that it provides transparency regarding the details of the concluded transactions and that it discloses the means for monitoring whether these weapons were used in oppression and violations, as the Czech Parliament is obliged to open an independent investigation in this regard. The report also calls on the EU to ensure that the Czech Republic and other member states comply with the arms trade standards provided for in EU law and resolutions.
Section II: The Czech republic’s obligations with regards to its arms trade
First: The national law of the Czech Republic governing the regulation of arms trade
Second: International and Regional obligations of Czech concerning the regulation of arms trade
Third: EU Council and European Parliament resolutions regarding Egypt since July 2013

Section III: Diplomatic and trade relations between Egypt and the Czech Republic
First: High Diplomatic relations despite the expansion of violations
Second: Czech arms exports to Egypt in numbers

Section IV: The nature of Egypt’s employment of czech arms
First: Ministry of Interior Staff in hold of Czech arms
Second: The Egyptian government en route for manufacturing Czech arms

Conclusion and Recommendations
Introduction

Following July 3, 2013, Egypt fell at the hands of an oppressive authority led by AbdelFattah El-Sisi following his coup against former president Mohamed Mursi who was elected in 2012. Sisi started his coup with what can be described as the largest massacre in Egypt's modern history, which has killed no less than 817 supporters of the Muslim Brotherhood supporters during the security forces’ dispersal of Rabaa and Nahda sit-ins by firing live ammunition at protesters.

Sisi’s regime hasn’t left much survivors, after six years of authoritarian rule, hundreds of people have lost their lives in peaceful protests that demanded the overthrow of Sisi. Thousands of protestors are locked in prisons, many of whom have been subjected to grave violations of human rights such as torture and forced disappearance, in addition to issuing massive execution orders, a conduct followed by the regime against the opposition, as well as countless violations in Sinai under the pretext of the war on terror, all of which within the “flourishing” of commercial relations between Egypt and the Czech Republic, that were not withheld by Egypt’s base record in violations of human rights. Czech continued to export light weapons such as rifles and guns to Egypt, that were directly used in oppression and violations, in contrary to heavy weapons such as aeroplanes and submarines, which can be used in defensive operations. The exports of Czech arms to Egypt increased eight times from 2012 to 2016.

This report aims at exposing the Czech Republic’s collaboration in the oppression that Egypt has lived through since summer 2013, through supplying the Egyptian regime with arms for over 7 years, severely violating the right to life, systemically committing crimes of torture, forced disappearance, and arbitrary executions, in addition to violating the right to association and as-

---

4 Previous Reference
assembling and restricting freedom of speech and expression, which counts as a breach for the international commitments of the Czech Republic as a signatory state to the arms trade treaty and a departure from the European stance on exporting weapons to Egypt following July 2013.

The report is divided into four main sections: The first section showcases the most prominent violations committed by the Egyptian authorities in the years following July 2013, where it is suspected that Czech arms were used, such as extrajudicial killing, forced disappearance, torture and violations within the context of the war on terror in Sinai, which counts as internal acts of oppression practiced by the authority that should by default lead to banning exporting weapons to it, according to the arms trade treaty signed by the Republic of Czech.

The second part of this report tackles in detail the commitments of the Czech Republic regarding exports, based on national law and the Arms Trade Treaty, which stipulates banning the export of weapons in case they are used in acts of oppression, committing violations or breaching international treaties. The unified position of the European Union Council and EU Parliament decisions regarding Egypt since July 2013 also include recommendations of halting the export of equipment and military technology to Egypt in the light of the soaring violations against human rights.

The third section of the report sheds light on the nature of the high diplomatic ties between the Czech and Egyptian authorities which can be interpreted in the continued influx of official delegations from both sides, including some businessmen in the defense industries. The section also analyses annual reports published by the Ministry of Industry and Trade in the period from 2012 to 2017, indicating the increasing value of arms exports and export licenses from the Czech Republic to Egypt.

The fourth section highlights the nature of using Czech arms by the Egyptian security forces, on top of which the Interior Ministry, adding to the suspicion of using these arms in committing grave violations against citizens, such as using the CZ SCORPION EVO rifle during the dispersal of Nahda sit-in on August 14, 2013, putting that together with what is revealed by the statements of both Egyptian and Czech officials to acquire a licence for manufacturing the Czech rifle CZ 807 inside Egyptian military factories.
Methodology

The report relies on tracking transactions of arms exported from the Czech Republic to Egypt through analysing the figures issued by the Czech Ministry of Industry and Trade published on its official website in the period 2012-2017. To monitoring rights violations by the Egyptian authorities, the report uses figures from the reports of a number of rights organizations inside and outside Egypt.

The report is also based on analysing a large number of videos issued by the Egyptian Ministry of Interior’s official page and a number of videos recorded by several media platforms such as Al-Masry Al-Youm media outlet in order to monitor the manner in which Czech arms have been used by the Egyptian authorities. It also tracks statements by the Egyptian minister for military production, the Czech Foreign Ministry, and the director of the manufacture company of Czech weapons.

Section I: An overview of human rights violations in Egypt

The army overthrew former President Mohamed Mursi in July 2013 on the backdrop of popular protests that demanded early presidential elections, in what came to be considered as a military coup against the first elected civilian president. Sisi, then defence minister who led the coup, officially became president of Egypt in April 2014 with a majority of 94.5 % in elections, a result that was described by observers as unfair and unequal.

Egypt in the era of Sisi witnessed a gross decline in human rights situation, as the authorities and security services have completely disregarded international law and human rights principles. The violent dispersal of Rabaa’ sit-in, which claimed the lives of hundreds of people, is a striking example of the nature of Sisi’s regime, which was founded on the suppression and abuse of the opposition under the pretext of national security and fighting terrorism.

Claiming the slogan of the war on terror should not be a ground for vio-
Exporting Violations

Exporting violations violating the sovereignty of law and the rights of citizens which are guaranteed by international conventions, some of which are rights that humans should not be deprived of regardless of the magnitude of the threat facing the state. According to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the prohibition of torture and the inhumane treatment are rights that cannot be restricted. The UN Human Rights Committee also stated that fair trial guarantees and non-arbitrary detention must be respected, even in times of emergency and war.

This part of the report showcases the internal oppression and human rights violations practiced by Sisi’s regime, which was probably aided by the use of Czech weapons. The most prominent of these violations was the shooting of live ammunition at protestors and the intensification of extrajudicial killings, especially in the context of the war on terror in Sinai. This counts as an internal oppressive act that prohibits the export of arms to any authority involved in these violations.

• Using Excessive Force against protesters

In the months subsequent to the military coup in July of 2013, the security forces fired live ammunition at protestors in several incidents the most significant of which the dispersal of Rabaa and Nahda sit-ins.

5 The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, December 16, 1966, https://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/CCPR.aspx
Wiki Thawra, an independent organisation that documents the events that followed the January revolution, has monitored the killing of at least 2588 people in political events since the military coup until the end of January 2014 in all governorates of Egypt, among which were the protests of the third anniversary of the revolution; counting 11 Journalists, 164 children, 72 women, 299 university student. The injuries toll during this period amounted to 18535.

---

The former killings and systematic use of lethal force against protesters by the army and police forces were carried out by weapons, including ones that were locally manufactured, and others imported from western countries. The report monitors the use of light arms imported by the security forces from the Czech Republic in a number of these incidents (see section IV of the report).

Violations Under the pretext of the war on terror in Sinai

Since October 2014, North Sinai has lived in an ongoing state of emergency because of the war on terror, which made individuals in the region subject to relentless violations of their basic rights. Starting October 2014 until December 2018, the army and police have killed 2,811 persons, who were described by the military spokesman as armed individuals. Since the beginning of the Comprehensive Military Operation in Sinai in February 2018, the violations have peaked; killing 23 civilians, including at least 3 children, according to local sources.

The regime’s policy of arbitrary arrests extended to Sinai. Between October 2014 and December 2018, at least 8,226 individuals, described by the military spokesman as “security suspects” or “suspected terrorists,” were arrested. The security forces in Sinai have also adopted a policy of destroying and burning the property of people on claims of their cooperation with terrorist groups. It burned down and demolished 1431 houses, 216 warehouses, 290 trenches, 486 tunnels, 1139 shelters and hideouts, burned 1649 motorcycles, 1,572 vehicles and 519 four-wheeled vehicles, according to statements by the official military spokesman.

**Arbitrary Arrests**

Following July 2013, the authorities in Egypt started besetting the gains of the revolution, predominantly the freedom of opinion and expression, through issuing a law that regulates protests in November 2013\(^1\) and an anti-terrorism law\(^2\) which were both used by the regime to legalize and legitimize many arbitrary arrests. It is estimated that the number of political prisoners in Egypt (from July 2013 until 2017) account to around 60 thousand people\(^3\).

---

\(^1\) Law 107/2013 on the regulation of the right to public meetings, gatherings and peaceful protests [http://qadaya.net/?p=6597](http://qadaya.net/?p=6597).


\(^5\) Wiki Thawara, a record of the arrested and prosecuted during the Sisi/Adly Mansour era, updated until May 14, 2014 (Cairo, 2014) [https://wikithawra.wordpress.com/2014/01/09/sisi-mansour-detainees/](https://wikithawra.wordpress.com/2014/01/09/sisi-mansour-detainees/).

\(^6\) The Egyptian Coordination for Rights and Freedoms, A Nation’s Scream: The 2017 Harvest, (Cairo, 2017) [https://drive.google.com/file/d/1DFujuqG9Vh4Yc3W4FTRh5TaxuHfHAbCT/view](https://drive.google.com/file/d/1DFujuqG9Vh4Yc3W4FTRh5TaxuHfHAbCT/view).

\(^7\) Egyptian Front for Human Rights, Explicit Message: Repression Continues, (Cairo, 2018), [https://egyptianfront.org/research/analytical-reports/explicit-message-repression-continues/](https://egyptianfront.org/research/analytical-reports/explicit-message-repression-continues/)
• **Forced Disappearance**

Arbitrary and collective arrests were accompanied by the regime’s policy of enforced disappearances through detainees in illegal detention centers for varying periods of time before being brought before the prosecution. During the period of disappearance, the detainees were reported to be subjected to torture and unlawful interrogation, as well as being deprived from contact with their lawyers and relatives.

The Interior Ministry has acknowledged the enforced disappearance of 500 out of 700 persons, whose families had reported that they had been forcibly disappeared since 2015, by admitting that they were in detention at the time of disappearance, according to Hafez Abu Saada, a member of the National Council for Human Rights, which counts as an official confession by the authorities of committing enforced disappearances.

---


• Torture

Since he came to power, Sisi has resorted to the systematic use of torture which led to death in many cases\textsuperscript{20}. Officers resort to psychological and physical torture, ranging from beatings and electric shocks to threatening to harm a person or his family as a means of forcing defendants to confess to the charges against them. And as a result of the authorities’ disregard or denial of torture complaints, perpetrators of crimes of torture often enjoy impunity and escape punishment\textsuperscript{21}.

As a conclusion and after more than five years since the military coup, the Egyptian authorities has used the slogan of the war on terror as a crude pretext for violating the rights of citizens, including the right to life, the prohibition of torture, the prohibition of inhumane and degrading treatment, the right of assembly and association, and the right to freedom of expression: violations that have been documented by several domestic and international human rights reports. This raises direct questions about the Czech Republic’s respect for the principles of human rights considering its continued export of arms to the Egyptian authorities, which could be used in internal oppression and direct violations against citizens.

\textsuperscript{20} “Torture and Disappearance in Egypt.. the stories behind numbers”, Hader Almahdawi, Mada Masr, May 12, 2016, https://madamasr.com/ar/2016/05/12/feature/%D8%B3%D9%8A%D8%A7%D8%B3%D8%A9%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%AA%D8%B9%D8%B0%D9%8A%D8%A8-%D9%88%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A7%D8%AE%D8%AA%D9%81%D8%A7%D8%A1-%D9%81%D9%8A-%D9%85%D8%B5%D8%B1-%D9%82%D8%B5%D8%B5-%D9%85%D8%A7-%D9%88%D8%B1%D8%A7%D8%A1-%D8%A7/.


\textsuperscript{22} The Egyptian Coordination for Rights and Freedoms, The Scream of a Nation: Harvest of the year 2017, (Cairo, 2017) https://drive.google.com/file/d/1DFuijqq9Vh4Yc3W4FTRh5taxuHFhAbCT/view
Section II: The Czech republic`s obligations with regards to its arms trade

Arms trade control is the duty of each state participating in international commercial transactions, and in their trade, states must ensure that human rights are respected. According to the Arms Trade Treaty signed by the Czech Republic, the duty to respect human rights in the arms trade stems from customary international law, criminal international law, human rights treaties as well as treaties regulating arms trade.

During the conclusion of arms trade agreements, states must observe conventions, treaties and charters on human rights, such as the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the Geneva Conventions, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. EU member states have a duty to comply with European Union law, in accordance with the principle of the supremacy of EU law over national law, according to which Member States have to harmonize their domestic laws in accordance with the European Union law.

We discuss in this section the legal framework for the commitments of the Czech Republic regarding the respect of human rights in the context of arms trade. The first part addresses the local laws of the Czech Republic regulating Arms Trade and its export process. The second part tackles the international and regional commitments of the Czech Republic in the area of arms trade, as well as the conditions that must be observed and met before exporting arms, especially with regard to the human rights situation in the importing country, while the third part addresses the decisions and conclusions of the European Union on exporting weapons to Egypt since July 2013.

First: The national law of the Czech Republic governing the regulation of arms trade

Law 38/1994 regulates foreign trade in military materials. The arms trade in the Czech Republic is under the control of four ministries: Ministry of De-

fense, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Interior and Ministry of Industry and Trade, which holds the final opinion in issuing or rejecting the export authorization.

Article 6 (2) of Law 38/1994 provides that “the Ministry of Industry and Trade shall give permission to (export) after taking binding opinions from the authorities concerned, which are:

Ministry of Foreign Affairs: in terms of foreign policy interests of the Czech Republic, and adherence to international treaties and Czech membership in international organizations.

Ministry of the Interior: in terms of public order, security and protection of citizens.

Ministry of Defense: in terms of securing the defense of the Czech Republic.

The law regulates the licensing of Czech arms exports to other countries. Where legal entities apply for a license to the Ministry of Industry and Trade, which decides, with the ministries provided for in Article 6 (2), whether or not to grant the license. Article 18 of Law 38/1994 states that the Ministry does not grant the license in case «the applicant violates the provisions of this law or the law of the European Union, or the international treaties of the Czech Republic with regard to trade or dealing with military equipment.»

Despite that the Czech law doesn’t explicitly mention conditions regarding the ban on arms exports to countries with a record of grave violations of human rights, it does indicate at several points its commitment to international conventions and the European law, which imposes restrictions on the country in granting permits for arms exports to countries that use these weapons in acts of internal oppression.
Second: International and Regional obligations of the Czech Republic concerning the regulation of arms trade

- The Arms Trade Treaty (2014)

The Arms Trade Treaty has adopted several standards on human rights and prohibited acts, which the Czech Republic, as a member state, must take into account when signing arms export agreements with other countries, where it is prohibited to allow the export of arms to certain countries that practice any of the prohibited acts provided for, or indicates the risk of a human rights violation under the treaty.

The Arms Trade Treaty regulates the transfer of arms among its member States. The Czech Republic has signed the Arms Trade Treaty in June 2013 and ratified it in September 2014, which makes it legally binding. The Treaty defines the «international arms trade» as including exports, imports, transit, re-shipment and brokering.

According to the Arms Trade Treaty, conventional weapons covered by trade in accordance with article 2 (1) include:

- Battle tanks
- Armored combat vehicles
- Large-scale artillery systems
- Combat aircraft
- Offensive helicopters
- War vessels
- Missiles and missile launchers
- Small arms and light weapons

Considering that most of the arms exported from the Czech Republic to Egypt are light weapons (rifles and pistols), which are part of the Arms Trade Treaty, respect for human rights must be one of the basic principles of the Arms Trade Agreement. Principle 5 of the set of principles provided for in the Arms Trade Treaty calls for “Respecting and ensuring respect for international humanitarian law in accordance with, inter alia, the Geneva Conventions of 1949, and respecting and ensuring respect for human rights in accordance with, inter alia, the Charter of the United Nations and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.”

The treaty expressly prohibits arms trade to countries that violate human rights. Article 6 (3) of the treaty states: “A State Party shall not authorize any transfer of conventional arms covered if it has knowledge at the time of authorization that the arms or items would have been used in the commission of genocide, crimes against humanity, grave breaches of the Geneva Conventions of 1949, attacks directed against civil objects or civilians protected as such, or other war crimes as defined by international agreements to which it is a Party.”

After ascertaining that the export is not prohibited under Article 6, the State shall conduct the "export assessment" process, in which it assesses several possibilities, and the exporting State Party does not authorize the export if there is a significant risk that any of the negative consequences will occur.

According to Article 7 of the treaty, the State assesses exports by means of whether such weapons:

- would contribute to or undermine peace and security;
- could be used to:
  1. commit or facilitate a serious violation of international humanitarian law;
  2. commit or facilitate a serious violation of international human rights law;
  3. commit or facilitate an act constituting an offence under international conventions or protocols relating to terrorism to which the exporting State is a Party; or
  4. commit or facilitate an act constituting an offence under international conventions or protocols relating to transnational organized crime to which the exporting State is a Party.

The treaty adds in Article 7(4) that the exporting State Party, in making this assessment, shall take into account the risk of the conventional arms covered being used to commit or facilitate serious acts of gender-based violence or serious acts of violence against women and children.

- **The Unified Position of the EU Council CFSP/944/2008**

The Czech law refers to the unified position of the EU Council as one of the regional obligations of the Czech Republic regarding Arms Trade. The EU Council adopted its unified position 944/2008, targeting the establishment of unified high standards for the management and restriction of the transfer of technology and military equipment by Member States. The Council states in Article 4 that: "Member States are determined to prevent the export of military technology and equipment which might be used for internal repression or international aggression or contribute to regional instability".

The unified position has established eight criteria for member states to commit to in the international trade of military equipment and technology. The second criterion provides for the respect of the importing state for human rights and international humanitarian law, and that after assessing the attitude of the importing state towards the principles established in international human rights mechanisms, Member States shall deny an export licence if there is a clear risk that the military technology or equipment to be exported might be used for internal repression. In the sense that arms should not be exported if there is evidence of the latter's use of them in internal repression. According to this treaty, *Internal repression is defined as torture and other cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment*.

---

summary or arbitrary executions, disappearances, arbitrary detentions and other major violations of human rights and fundamental freedoms as set out in relevant international human rights instruments, including the Universal Declaration on Human Rights and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.

All which are patterns that are almost identical to the human rights violations committed by the authorities in Egypt for years, especially against the opposition.

**European Law No. 258/2012 against Illicit Manufacturing and Trafficking in Firearms**

Law 258/2012 sets a clear framework for arms trade policies in EU countries. The European Parliament and EU Council adopted this law on March 14, 2012, for the implementation of article 10 of the United Nations Protocol against the Illicit Manufacturing and Trafficking in Firearms, their Parts and Components and Ammunition. Article 10 of the Act provides that “In deciding whether to grant an export authorisation under this Regulation, Member States shall take into account all relevant considerations including, where appropriate:

(a) their obligations and commitments as parties to the relevant international export control arrangements or relevant international treaties;

(b) considerations of national foreign and security policy, including those covered by Common Position 2008/944/CFSP;

(c) considerations as to intended end use, consignee, identified final recipient and the risk of diversion”.

---


It is conclusive from the above that the unified position of the EU Council 944/2008 and law 258/2012 have set binding criteria for the Czech Republic as a Member State of the EU with regard to its arms trade. Under these laws, the Czech Republic is prohibited from exporting arms to States that may use it for internal repression and, if there is evidence for that, the Republic is required to prohibit the export of arms to that State, which is in conformity with the criteria included in the Arms Trade Treaty, that obliges them to prevent exports to countries experiencing a sharp deterioration in their human rights record, otherwise this would be a violation of those treaties.

**Third: EU Council and European Parliament resolutions regarding Egypt since July 2013**

- **August 21, 2013**
  EU Council of Foreign Affairs Decision: Suspension of arms licenses used for oppression in Egypt

- **February 10, 2014**
  EU Council of Foreign Affairs Decision: Confirmation of the Suspension of arms licenses to Egypt

- **July 17, 2014**
  EU Parliament Decision: Prohibition of exporting security equipment or military aid which are likely to be used in suppression of peaceful protests

- **January 15, 2015**
  EU Parliament Decision: Confirmation of the Prohibition of exporting security equipment or military aid which are likely to be used in suppression of peaceful protests

- **March 16, 2016**
  EU Parliament Decision: Suspension of exporting Surveillance equipment if proven to be used in human rights violations

- **February 8, 2018**
  EU Parliament Decision: Acknowledging that European Companies continue to export arms to Egypt despite human rights violations

With the escalation of violations committed by the Egyptian authorities against the opposition after July 2013, the EU Council of Foreign Affairs and the European Parliament issued a number of resolutions concerning Egypt, which demanded the suspension of arms exports to it based on the escalation of human rights violations.
The most prominent of these decisions was the Council’s decision on August 21, 2013, which stated that “the recent operations of the Egyptian security forces were disproportionate and led to a large and unacceptable number of murders and injuries.” Accordingly, the EU Member States agreed “to suspend Egypt’s export licenses for any equipment that could be used for internal repression and to reassess export licenses for equipment covered by the Unified Position (944/2008 / CFSP) and to review security aids with Egypt.”

On February 10, 2014, the EU Foreign Affairs Council reaffirms its decision of suspending export licenses to Egypt. These outcomes came in reaction to the violence that took place during the constitutional referendum and commemoration of the third anniversary of the revolution, as the police used disproportionate force against the protests by the opposition. The Council called on the Egyptian government at the time to “investigate the killing of protesters and all events of violence since 30 June,” as well as demand of the Government to fulfil its promise and to conduct an independent and transparent investigation into these events.

On July 17, 2014, the EU Parliament passed a resolution expressing its concern and condemnation for the suppression of the opposition, journalists, human rights defenders and civil society workers. The Parliament called for “an expanded ban within the European Union on the export of surveillance technology that can be used in espionage and repression of citizens as well as export of security equipment or military aid that can be used to suppress peaceful protests.”

On January 15, 2015, the EU Parliament renewed its demand for a ban on the export of security equipment and military aid that could be used in the suppression of peaceful protests or against the strategic and security interests of the European Union. The resolution included the parliament’s expression of “grave concern about continuing restrictions on fundamental rights”. More than 40,000 people have been arrested after unprecedented crackdowns and nearly 1,400 people have been killed as a result of the excessive use of force by the security forces.

And after finding the body of Italian Phd student Julio Regini in a Cairo suburb on February 2016, showing signs of being beaten and severely tortured following being disappeared since January 25, 2016, the European parliament passed a resolution on March 10, 2016, calling on its Member States to fully respect its “Foreign Affairs Council resolution in August 2013 on exporting military technology and equipment and cooperation in the field of security” and stressed upon the “EU-wide ban of exporting surveillance equipment to Egypt if proven to have been used in committing violations against human rights.”

The latest decisions of the European Parliament on 8 February 2018 condemned the death sentences in Egypt and called on the Parliament to stop their implementation. The Union called for “a clear, firm and unified stance towards Egypt … as long as the state failed to show remarkable progress in the human rights record.” That was after the decision pointed to the continuation of a number of European companies in supplying equipment of spying and monitoring, as well as military missions to Egypt.

These decisions, issued by the highest bodies of the European Union, the Council for Foreign Affairs and the European Parliament, clearly demonstrate the European Union’s determination to reject the repression and violation of citizens’ rights in all its forms and manifestations practiced by the Egyptian authorities and the desire not to be involved in these violations through permanent assertion of the refusal to export military equipment to Egypt, which makes the Czech Republic’s breach of these decisions and its continuation of exporting light weapons to Egypt in violation of this consensus.

Section III: Diplomatic and trade relations between Egypt and the Czech Republic

This part of the report tackles the mutual relations between the two countries throughout 2014 until the beginning of 2019, highlighting the presidential and ministerial visits as well as points of cooperation, through tracking statements made by Czech’s Foreign affairs ministry regarding Egypt in that duration, in addition to focusing on the areas of trade relations and military exports between the two countries and highlighting the official figures contained in the reports of the Ministry of Industry and Trade regarding the arms exported to Egypt, in terms of the number of licenses and the value of transactions.

**First: High Diplomatic Relations despite the expansion of violations**

The diplomatic ties between the Czech Republic and the Egyptian regime have witnessed an unprecedented improvement in the years following July 2013, as the Czech Republic has shown unconditional support for the Egyptian government, especially in terms of military support, under the auspices of its support for “fighting terrorism” which naturally ignores the current political reality of Egypt and the internal repression practiced by the Egyptian authorities against peaceful opposition from all backgrounds.

This is reflected in the Czech Foreign Ministry’s condemnation of terrorist attacks that took place in Sinai in a statement published in October 2014, saying: “The Czech Ministry of Foreign Affairs condemns any kind of terrorism and expresses its solidarity with all countries struggling to maintain security and democracy while committing to and respecting all human rights.”

In the following years, however, the Czech Republic ignored Egypt’s massive human rights violations and it failed to comply with EU institutions’ decisions to ban arms exports to Egypt, and continued to export arms to the same authorities involved in such abuses.

Over the past five years, Egypt and the Czech Republic have exchanged several of these “fruitful” ministerial visits, The Czech official delegations have included a number of businessmen in various fields, especially defense industries. The two sides also exchanged diplomatic visits between foreign ministers and the ministers of industry and trade in both countries. Their meetings discussed ways to strengthen relations between the two countries in terms of economic relations, trade, armaments and energy. The following

---

is a schedule of official visits between Egypt and the Czech Republic from 2014 to the beginning of 2018 as well as a brief description of the nature of participating delegations in these visits:

A look at the most important visits between the Egyptian and the Czech sides:

- **March 2014**: The Egyptian Deputy Foreign Minister visited the Czech Republic and met with his Czech counterpart.
- **June 2014**: The Czech Republic’s Foreign Affairs Director of the President’s office visited Egypt and met with Sisi and the Foreign Minister.
- **April 2015**: The Egyptian Foreign Minister visited the Czech Republic and met with his counterpart, he also met the Minister of Industry and Trade and the Prime Minister.
- **January 2016**: Czech Republic’s Foreign Minister and Deputy Defence Minister visited Egypt, as well as businessmen and representatives of the Czech arms industry. They met with the Egyptian Foreign Minister, the Minister of Military Production, Major General Al-Asar and President Sisi.
- **April 2016**: Czech Republic’s Minister of Industry and Trade visited Egypt, along with 30 representatives of the business sector and met with his counterpart and the Minister of Energy.
- **August 2017**: Czech’s Republic Deputy Minister of Energy visited Egypt, met his Egyptian counterpart and held some meetings at the Ministry of Defence.
- **September 2017**: Czech Republic’s Deputy of non-European State visited Egypt and met with the Foreign Ministry’s Aide.
Exporting Violations for European Affairs.

- **October 2018:** Czech Republic’s Members of the Senate Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and National Security visited Egypt and met their counterparts in the Egyptian Parliament.

- **June 2019:** Members of the Czech Defense and National Security Committee visited their counterparts again in the Egyptian parliament.

Second: Czech Arms Exports to Egypt in numbers

According to annual reports presented by the Czech Republic to the Arms Trade Treaty Committee, the Czech Republic is one of two main sources for light weapons in Egypt, which include automatic rifles, grenades and pistols, some of which are likely to be used by the Egyptian authorities for direct oppression and human rights violations in Egypt.

This section presents a statistical analysis of arms exports from the Czech Republic to Egypt from 2012 to 2017. It also highlights the low level of transparency with regard to the official data published by the ministries of the Czech Republic regarding this type of information.

**Transparency**

Official reports and statements don’t provide any detailed information of actual arms that had been exported from Czech or its size. Only the total figures are what can be obtained from the reports of the Ministry of Industry and Trade, the reports of the Arms Trade Treaty Commission and the EU Register reports, making it difficult to track arms exports, and easier for exporting countries to evade accountability for the use of these weapons, especially the ones experiencing deteriorating human rights conditions.

The Egyptian Front for Human Rights sent an official letter to the Czech Republic’s Ministry of Industry and Trade asking for information on the types and numbers of arms exported to Egypt in the past years. The Ministry’s response was as follows: “The Ministry of Industry and Trade publishes information on trade in military materials to the extent permitted by law, in particular under Law No. 412/2005 Sb, on the protection of confidential information. With the highest possible transparency, which ensures the protection of the vital interests of the Czech Republic.”, a response that raises serious questions about the nature and concept of transparency standards adopted by the Czech Republic and whether terms such as vital interests are used to justify the concealment of information about the public.

**Weapons Exports**

Due to the lack of transparency regarding the types and numbers of arms

---


exports in detail, the Egyptian Front relied on the compilation of such data by Czech companies for the reports issued to the Czech Ministry of Industry and Trade, as well as a number of non-official reports, which stated that in 2013 arms exported from the Czech Republic to Egypt included 50000 CZ-75 (Duty handguns), four hundreds of CZ Scorpion EVO 3A1 rifles, and 805 BREN A1 (Assault rifles).

In 2014, an agreement was signed for the export of 50000 CZ-75 P-07 pistols, and 10,000 rounds of 9 mm ammunition, the same weapons the Egyptian security services had been monitored using.

According to the Ministry of Industry and Trade annual reports, the licenses granted to export arms to Egypt have increased significantly, especially between 2013-2016 compared to 2012. In 2012, 21 licenses to export arms to Egypt were approved by the Czech government. This number rose to 32 in 2013, the same year of Rabaa’s sit-in violent dispersal, the military coup and the EU arms embargo. In 2014 and 2015, as human rights violations escalated in Egypt, the Czech government agreed to give 26 and 28 licenses to export arms to Egypt.

### LICENCES - export of military material

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>number of licences the ministries approved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Progress of the number of arms licenses exported to Egypt (2012-2017)


According to the same reports, the proceeds of arms exports to Egypt have increased significantly since 2013. While the Czech Republic exported arms worth 5 million euros in 2012, this figure tripled in 2013, with Egypt importing more than 24 million euros worth of arms from the Czech Republic. While the peak of arms exports to Egypt is in 2017, as exports amounted to more than 41 million euros.

The following table shows the value of arms exports from the Czech Republic to Egypt during 2012-2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>in thousand EUR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>13657</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>41929</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>3829</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>19857</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>24320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>5595</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Progress of Czech arms exports to Egypt in the period (2012-2017)

Considering the percentage of arms export to Egypt in comparison with the total sum of exports, we find a similar hike in 2012. In 2012, the Czech Republic allocated 2.1% of total arms exports to Egypt, which quadrupled in 2013, with the Czech Republic allocating 8.4% of its arms exports to Egypt, Egypt becoming the third largest importer of Czech weapons and the fifth in 2016 with a 6%, compared to being the 11th importer in 2012.

The following table shows the development of Egypt’s share of exports from the Czech Republic and the ranking of Egypt among other countries importing arms from the Czech Republic during the period 2012-2017.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Share of military material items in the use of export licences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YEAR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The development of Czech weapons imported to Egypt and its ranking (in the duration between 2012-2017)
Section IV: The nature of Egypt`s employment of Czech Arms

In light of the violations previously mentioned, the Egyptian authorities appear to be involved in countless violations of its citizens` rights. These violations involve the executive branch through the security services and the judiciary; which does not make an effort to bring officials to justice. The Czech government has its share of responsibility as it preferred to maintain its trade relations with Egypt while turning a blind eye to its poor record of human rights.

The report relied on monitoring the use of Czech weapons by the security services such as the CZ Scorpion Evo 3A 1 through analyzing dozens of photographs and video clips published by the Ministry of the Interior on its official page as well as independent media platforms. The most obvious of these were during the break-up of Al-Nahda sit-in on 14 August 2013.

Through following up with statements of Egyptian and Czech officials, the Egyptian government`s quest for acquiring a manufacturing license for some Czech weapons inside Egypt such as the CZ 807 rifle has been observed.

First: Czech Weapons in the hands of Interior Ministry members

The seriousness of acquiring these weapons and their use by the Egyptian Ministry of the Interior stems from the fact that this ministry is directly responsible for internal repression and human rights violations in Egypt, especially extrajudicial killings, suppression of peaceful protests, forced disappearances, torture and arbitrary detention of opponents, all which are systematic violations by the Egyptian authorities.

The first time Czech weapons appeared with members of the Egyptian
Ministry of Interior was during the violent dispersal of the Nahda sit-in on August 14, 2013, which left at least 90 people killed and 613 wounded.

It’s a weapon used by members of the Egyptian police, a weapon manufactured by Česká zbrojovka company, which is a Czech joint stock company made up of a number of businessmen, that naturally gets its license for exporting weapons to Egypt from the Czech government.

Other photos confirm that the interior ministry used the same weapon CZ Scorpion Evo 3 A1 in violent oppressive acts towards the opposition following July 2013. In January 2014, around 49 were killed, 247 were injured and 1341 were arrested in protests commemorating the third anniversary of the revolution. In 2015, on the fourth anniversary of the revolution, at least 26 persons were killed in confrontations between the protesters and the police, 94 were injured and more than 500 people were arrested. In January 2016, the Association for Freedom of Thought and Expression in Egypt monitored

58 The Egyptian Commission for Rights and Freedoms, on the anniversary of the January 25 revolution, the killing continues, (Cairo, 2015) https://www.ec-rf.net/?p=70.
the arrests of at least 164 people - mostly from Cairo (57 person) - during the breaking up of protests on the revolution’s anniversary⁵⁹.

It can be argued that the visible part of the Ministry of the Interior’s violations, such as the violent suppression of peaceful protests, is the tip of the iceberg, which hides underneath the larger and more serious violations such as liquidations, extrajudicial killings, forced disappearances of the opposition as well as their physical and psychological torture to extort confessions out of them, which in many cases lead to their death. All these are violations practiced by the authorities in a systematic manner, mostly by the Ministry of Interior that uses Czech weapons in these practices.

For instance, members of the Interior Ministry liquidated 10 people in North Sinai’s Arish on January 12, 2017 in retaliation for killing 8 people in the firefighters ambush in Arish. The ministry said that those who were liquidated were involved in killing policemen in North Sinai and that they started firing as soon as the forces approached them, which led to their killing, according to a statement by the ministry⁶⁰. The statement provoked the elders of the tribes these men belonged to, who discredited the official story confirming that their relatives were already detained by the security services before their liquidations, demanding an investigation into the matter⁶¹.

The photo below shows men from the security directorate of North Sinai, of the ministry of the interior, a few days after this incident carrying the Czech weapon CZ SCORPION EVO 3 A1 in a promotional video published by the official page of the Interior Ministry on January 24, 2017, which casts doubts about the likelihood of using the weapon in this incident and others.

(A photo displaying members of the interior ministry carrying CZ SCORPION EVO 3 A1 in the anniversary of the January revolution in North Sinai, 2017⁶²)


Second: The Egyptian Government en route for manufacturing Czech arms

Statements by Egyptian and Czech officials show the Egyptian government’s desire to manufacture thousands of Czech weapons through obtaining a license to manufacture types of weapons within the factories of the armed forces, indicating the ambition of the Ministry of Military Production to develop its armament, which may allow it to expand its independent export to other countries later.

The Egyptian Ministry of Military Production is in the process of obtaining a license to manufacture a number of tactical weapons inside the military factories in Egypt, mainly the CZ 807 rifle63, according to statements made in February 2016 by Lubomir Kovarík, the CEO of Ceská zbrojovka. This can also be understood from the statement made by the Czech Foreign Ministry at the end of January 2016 after a meeting between the Egyptian Minister of Military Production and a number of defense industry men in which he said that there will be cooperation in the development of the Egyptian military production capabilities and that they are interested in the transfer of Czech military production technology to Egypt64.

---


64 Al-Hayah Channel «Hayat Al-Youm - Minister of Military Production | The Czech Republic stood next to Egypt on June 30 and there are strong relations between the two countries,» YouTube Video, 31 January 2016, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1uzPWWw.
According to the company’s director, the manufacturing license involves the Egyptian side assembling Czech components in Egypt. At a later stage, the assembly will include parts manufactured in the Czech Republic and others manufactured in Egypt. This was confirmed by statements made by Egypt’s Minister of Military Production Mohamed Saeed El-Assar in a TV show in January 2017, as he said that his ministry is producing a number of weapons on its own (The Military Production Ministry owns several factories producing weapons used by the army). He added that the ministry can cooperate with a foreign state for building factories in Egypt and help provide the required technology, and it can contract on components that the ministry will collect and develop until it produces 100% Egyptian weapons.

The risk of this Egyptian endeavor for acquiring the license, then manufacturing these arms or ones similar to it independently from the Czech Republic, is that the Egyptian regime then will be able to expand its arms trade using these weapons, which could later reach countries with a lesser record of democracy and more disregard for human rights, in the regional and international sphere of Egypt, a matter that is already aspired to by the Egyptian authorities, according to statements by the minister of military production, “and the vice-president of the Arab Organization for Industrialization”.

Concluding from the above, the nature of the Egyptian authorities’ view of Czech weapons shows that, apart from using them in practices that violate the rights of Egyptian citizens, they seek to obtain licenses to invest in the development of the Egyptian arsenal, thus helping to expand its economy later, through the export of modern weapons, which exceeds internal repression and advances into a threat of international peace and security.

Conclusion and Recommendations

Despite the involvement of the current Egyptian authorities in committing violations against human rights since July 2013, the Czech Republic continues to export weapons to Egypt, not only that but it is working on helping it acquire a licence of manufacturing these weapons, which confirms the decline of respect for human rights against the material benefits that the current government gains from these deals. Serious questions have been raised about whether the Czech government ascertains that its exported arms are used in committing violations inside Egypt.

The Czech Republic is in breach of its regional and international commitments by exporting weapons to Egypt, according to the Arms Trade Treaty and the EU Council’s Unified Position regarding the regulation of the Arms Trade which bans exporting arms to countries where internal repression and violations of human rights occur, such as Egypt, noting that the violations by the authorities have escalated since July 2013. New patterns of violations emerged such as extrajudicial killings, violent dispersal of protests, forced disappearance, and systemic torture, all of which have not raised alarm for the Czech government exporting light weapons to Egypt, to the contrary, the export transactions witnessed a marked increase in the duration of 2013-2017.

With evidence of using Czech weapons such as CZ Scorpion Evo 3 A1 by the Egyptian security services in violent violations such as dispersing the Nahda sit-in in 2013 that killed at least 90 people, the Czech authorities is required by the Czech, European and international public opinion to disclose the details of weapons exported to Egypt and to explain its criteria for assessing the human rights situation, and make sure that they do not contribute to violations committed by the Egyptian authorities against citizens.
Based on the above, the Egyptian Front presents a number of recommendations:

1- The Czech government must halt its export of light weapons to Egypt as they are used in committing violations and suspend its support for the Egyptian government in committing more atrocities.

2- The Czech Ministry of Industry and Trade must abide by transparency regarding its arms trade and disclose details of deals and transactions with Egypt as well as a clarification of the standards followed before releasing export licenses, and the extent of its monitoring of the Egyptian authorities usages of these arms in committing rights violations.

3- The Czech Parliament has to establish an independent committee with the participation of civil society organisations to monitor arms deals concluded by the Ministry of Industry and Trade with the Egyptian government in order to maintain that the government commits to the Arms Trade Treaty and its commitment as a Member State of the EU.

4- The European Parliament must ensure that Member States comply with the EU’s Unified Position, the resolutions of the EU Council and the European Parliament, and adopt binding legal formulas for Member States prohibiting them from exporting weapons to States where the authorities carry out internal repression and violations of human rights.

5- The Egyptian government must immediately stop its violations against Egyptian citizens and refrain from holding the slogan of the “War on terror” to justify such violations.
Exporting Violations

Attachments

1- A letter from the Egyptian Front to Czech’s Ministry of Industry and Trade requesting clarifications detailing the types and amount of arms exported to Egypt.

I am writing on behalf of the Egyptian Front for Human Rights, a non-governmental organization in the Czech Republic, which monitors the human rights situation in Egypt and seeks to improve it and inform the public about current challenges. We are now preparing a report on the export of Czech weapons to Egypt and the form of their final use. We would therefore like to request additional information that is not publicly available. Of course it is legally possible to provide this information.

Annual reports on export control of military equipment show the number and categories of licenses, including their financial value, as well as their actual use. However, we did not find accurate data regarding the types of weapons exported by the Czech Republic to Egypt, as well as their quantities. We would therefore like to ask you to verify this information, if available somewhere, or ask you to provide this information if this type of information can be provided.

---

To: “posta” <posta@mpo.cz>

---

Dobrý den,

píši Vám jménem české nevládní organizaceEgyptská Fronta za lidská práva, která monitoruje lidskoprávní situaci v Egyptě a snaží se o její zlepšení i informování široké veřejnosti o aktuálních výzvách. V tomto okamžiku připravujeme report o vývozu českých zbraní do Egypta a jejich konečném použití. Z tohoto důvodu bych Vás chtěl poprosit o doplňující informace, které nejsou veřejně dostupné. Samozřejmě pouze v případě, že je z právního hlediska možné tyto informace poskytnout.

Ve výročních zprávách o kontrole vývozu vojenského materiálu lze nalézt počet licencí a jejich kategorie, včetně jejich finanční hodnoty, a také jejich reálné využití. Nicméně postrádáme data týkající se přesných druhů zbraní, které do Egypta naše země vyváží, a také jejich množství. V důsledku bych Vás tedy chtěl požádat o odkázání na zdroj této informace, pokud je někde dostupný, nebo o poskytnutí těchto dat, v případě, že je možné tento druh informací poskytovat.
2- The Ministry’s response to the letter, in which it refuses to disclose any additional details, under the pretext of the Czech’s Republic vital interests.

Regarding your attached e-mail, we would like to inform you that the Ministry of Industry and Commerce publishes information on foreign trade in military material to the extent permitted by relevant legislation, in particular Act No. 412/2005 Coll Confidential Information, as amended, and its implementing regulations.

Furthermore, in the light of the other information mentioned above, the scope of the information provided provides the maximum level of transparency while protecting the important interests of the Czech Republic.
Egyptian Front for Human rights is a European Organization established in Czech Republic in 2017. The front works to improve the status of human rights in Egypt through research, advocacy and legal work in areas such as criminal justice.