



Winter of forcibly disappeared women in Egypt

A report to document human rights violations committed against 12 women detained pending investigations in the case no. 277 National Security for the year 2019 known in the media as “Allahomma Thawra” .

Winter of forcibly disappeared women in Egypt

A report to document human rights violations committed against 12 women detained pending investigations in the case no. 277 National Security for the year 2019 known in the media as "Allahomma Thawra".

A report by
Egyptian Front for Human Rights

www.egyptianfront.org
info@egyptianfront.org
Kounicova 42, Brno, 60200,
Czech Republic
+420 773 213 198

All printing and publication rights reserved under Creative Commons license 4.0

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>



April, 2019

CONTENT

A brief on the case	4
The right to communicate with outside world	6
The Right to dignified treatment and prohibition of torture.	9
The right to legal defence and legal representation.	11
Attachements	13

A brief on the case

The case no. 277 for the year 2019 National Security, known in the media as Allahomma Thawra, began January 2019 in parallel with the fifth memory of the 25th of January revolution. The case includes 54 defendants, 13 of whom are girls and women from Cairo, Giza, Sharkeya, Alexandria, and Qalyobya governorates. These women were subjected to enforced disappearance for up to four months and then appeared before National Security prosecution in January 2019.

National security prosecution accused the defendants of joining and funding a terrorist group called "Allahomma Thawra" and using social media platforms to disseminate terrorist ideas. According to Ministry of Interior, defendants have established an online entity under the name of "Allahomma thawra" to carry out their terrorist plans in order to incite chaos in the country. MOI claims that this entity includes Muslim Brotherhood members and receives funds from foreign bodies¹. However, MOI didn't indicate the nature of the alleged terrorist plans nor identified individuals and foreign entities that fund this plan.

This report aims to monitor and document violations inflicted upon the 12 women pending investigations in this case by following up the events of the case with their lawyers. The names of these women are as follows; Nada Adel Mohamed Mohamed Morsi, Iman Hanafy Ahmed, Nevine Refaay Ahmed Refay, Ayatallah Ashraf Mohamed elSayed, Heba Mostafa Abd elHameed, Hend Mohamed Talaat Khalil, Abeer Nady Abdullah Mostafa, Zeinab Mohamed Mohamed Hussein, Fatma Gamal, Mai Yehia Azzam, Shaymaa Hassan.

The events of the case indicate that these women case subjected to prolonged enforced disappearance where they were tortured and treated with cruelty. They were also deprived from their right to legal representation and were interrogated in absence of their lawyers. This indicates a new level of punishment that dissent face in Egypt where rights are violated as well as standards of fair trial.

¹ Refer to Ministry of Interior statement: <https://www.facebook.com/MoiEgy/photos/pcb.2111691462207839/2111691228874529/?type=3&theater>

Defendants profiles:

Social status	Governorate	Occupation	Age	Names
Bachelorette	Sharkeyya	Student at Technical institute for industrial optics- Cairo	20 Years	Nada Adel Mohamed Mohamed Morsi
Grandparent	Giza	Arabic language Teacher	52 years	Iman Hanafy Ahmed
Two kids	Giza	Quran teacher	45 years	Nevine Refa'y Ahmed Refaay
Bachelorette	Qalyobia	Graphic designer	23 years	Ayatallah Ashrah Mohamed elSayed
Married with two children	Cairo	Housewife	38 years	Heba Mostafa Abd elHameed
Bachelorette	Alexandria	Lawyer	43 years	Hend Mohamed Talaat Khalil
Has children	Alexandria	Housewife	43 years	Abeer Nagy Abdullah Mostafa
Married with children	Cairo	Housewife	42 years	Zeinab Mohamed Mohamed Hussein
Bachelorette	Cairo	Student at Faculty of Commerce, English section, Ain Shams University	21 years	Fatma Gamal
With kids	Cairo	Physician	48 years	Mai Yehia Azzam
Married with three children	Cairo	Housewife	34 years	Shaimaa Hussein
With children	Fayoum	Housewife	56 years	Samya Gaber



- **The right to communicate with outside world**

A detainee has the right to inform, particularly, relatives or lawyers of their arrest as well as the place of detention. Also, law enforcement personnel have to inform prosecution of the arrest as well as bring the defendant before prosecution within 24 hrs. of the arrest. Violating the aforementioned principles is a breach of the detainee's right to communicate with the outside world; a principle that protects defendants from enforced disappearances, torture, and other forms of violations.

The case appeared before National Security prosecution by the end of January 2019 whereas families and defendants state that they were arrested in September and October 2019; almost three months before what MOI claims to be the date of arrest. During that period, detainees were kept in State Security headquarters, which are unofficial detention facilities, without referring them to prosecution, informing their families of their whereabouts, or allowing them to communicate with outside world.

As response to their disappearance, families of detainees sent telegrams to the attorney general to report them missing. In October 30, 2018, father of student Fatma Gamal filed a report to attorney general against Amr Sherif, assistant investigator in Ain Shams police station, Mahmoud Farag, low-ranking police officer in Ain Shams station, and a third unknown person accusing them of arresting his daughter on December 30, 2018, and forcibly disappearing her. **The father said that these officers "broke the iron gate of our building and knocked on our door, when I opened the door they asked me about Fatma, they took her after I guided them to her room. Since that day whenever we ask about her in the police station, they deny she's with them. We don't know anything about her until this moment" ²**

Also, on November 22, 2018, brother of detainee Nevine Refaay Ahmed Refaay sent a telegram holding the number 259142458 to attorney general

reporting the arrest of Nevine and her husband on September 28, 2018 and that they cannot find them in any of the police stations. **The brother says” they have two kids, Hamza seif eddeen and alHassan seif eddeen, 13 and 10 years old. They don’t have anyone right now and they cannot go to school since that time. For the sake of these kids, we request your honour to investigate their whereabouts”.**

Nevertheless, Nevine’s family didn’t receive any response regarding the whereabouts of their daughter where the police kept denying her arrest in the first place. She only appeared on January 26, 2019 before National Security prosecution in this case after forcibly disappearing for 120 days.

Fatma Gamal and Nevine Refa’ay are not the only two defendants who were subjected to enforced disappearance; as per the lawyer of the twelve women, all were subjected to enforced disappearance. The following table demonstrates the duration and places of enforced disappearances.

Place of enforced disappearance	Duration of enforced disappearance	Date where defendants were brought before prosecution	Date of arrest (according to defendants)	Place of arrest (according to defendants)	Name
National Security headquarter in Zazaeeg	109 Days	28/1/2019	11/10/2018	her house – Zazaeeg governorate	Nada Adel Mohamed Moghamed Morsi
National Security headquarter in Sheikh Zayed	116 Days	26/1/2019	2/10/2018	Her house- Giza	Iman Hanafy Ahmed
National Security in Sheikh zayed	120 Days	26/1/2019	28/9/2018	Her house- Giza	Nevine Refaay Ahmed Refay
National Security in elKhanka	116 Days	27/1/2019	3/10/2018	Her hose- elKhanka	Ayatallah Ashraf Mohamed elSayed
National Security in elAbaseyya	116 Days	27/1/2019	3/10/2018	Her house- helmeyyet elZaton	Heba Mostafa abd elHameed
National Security in Alexandria	125 Days	27/1/2019	24/9/2018	Her house- Alexandria	Hend Mohamed Talaat Khalil
National security premise in Alexandria	124 Days	27/1/2019	25/9/2018	Her house- Alexandria	Abeer Nady Abdullah Mostafa
National security headquarter in elAbaseya	118 Days	26/1/2019	30/9/2018	Her house- Hadayek helwan	Zeinab Mohamed Mohamed Hassan
National Security in elAbaseya	119 Days	27/1/2019	30/9/2018	Her house- Ain Shams	Fatma Gamal

National Security in elAbaseya	119 Days	27/1/2019	30/9/2018	Her house - Cairo	Mai Yehia Azzam
elMa'sara police station and National Security headquarter in elAbaseya	120 Days	28/1/2019	30/9/2018	Her house- Hadayek elMaadi	Shaimaa Hussein
National Security in elFayoum	120 days	28/1/2019	30/9/2018	Her house -elFayoum	Samia Gaber



• **The Right to dignified treatment and prohibition of torture.**

Everyone has the right to physical and mental integrity. Torture is a crime that is prohibited in international law where torture and cruel, inhumane and degrading treatment shall be penalized. Protection from torture, cruel and inhumane treatment are universal rights and principles of international law which apply to all countries, even to UN non-member states, and no derogations from these principles are allowed even in cases of “war against terrorism” .³

Majority of defendants reported before prosecution that they were tortured during their enforced disappearance in National Security headquarters. Torture varied from beating, electrocution, harassment, threatening. Eman Hanafy Ahmed said that as of her arrest on October 2, 2018 and until she was brought before prosecution on January 26, 2019 she has been lying blindfolded on the ground where national security officers beat her with his hands and legs and insulted her in most offensive ways. On the other hand, defendant Zeinab Mohamed informed prosecutor that **“she was blindfolded, beaten, and threatened, and added that someone beat her with a shoe on her face”**.

Also, sexual harassment was a tool used by National security officers to extract confessions from the women. Nevine Refaay, 45 years old, said that while she was buying her children some stuff, two people arrested her, blindfolded and insulted her, dumped her in a Toyota, and then took her to National Security headquarter for investigations, which is regarded as unofficial investigation place. She was also threatened with rape as **the officer told her “if you didn’t say what they want, these low ranking police officers haven’t gone on a vacation for thirty days, and you don’t want to know what they might do to you”**

Nevine added that they tore her hair, electrocuted her on her breasts and shoulders, and was threatened to strip her off clothes. **Nevine** says that she told national security prosecutor **“I am diabetic and hypertensive. I have liver**

³ Compilation of General Comments and General Recommendations Adopted by Human Rights Treaty Bodies, <http://hrlibrary.umn.edu/gencomm/hrcom20.htm>

failure, chest fractures, and roughness in my knees. I cannot defecate because it is a “baladi toilet” and my legs hurt very much. If you heard the sound that my leg make you will not believe me”

Torture and sexual harassment were also used with detainee **one of the defendants says “I was blindfolded, then the officer stripped me off my Abaya and threatened if I didn’t confess, he will let a number of low-ranking officers come in and they will send nude pictures of me. And during the whole duration of investigation he use to switch on the electric beside me and bring it near me as if he’s going to electrocute me. By the end of my detention period, I had bleeding underneath my skin and I had a lot of red spots all over my body as a result of psychological stress. Also, they took me to National Security headquarter in Shubra elKhaima, interrogated me and insulted me with profane words”.**

Heba Mostafa Abd elHameed also reported that after they took her to National security headquarter **they “blindfolded me, threatened to “make a party on me” (carry out sexual assaults) and take nude photos of me then send it to my children. In fact, one of them would bring his lips close to me during investigations and would sexually harass me while keeping the electric shock on during the whole duration of investigation”.**

Enforced disappearance and violations committed against defendants has terribly impacted their mental health and integrity. Detainee Hend Mohamed Talaat was kept in solitary confinement in National security headquarter in Alexandria for two months until she had a hysterical breakdown where she kept screaming and tearing her clothes. She was later transferred to another room with Abeer Nagy, a detainee in the same case, where she spent another two months before she was brought to National Security prosecution.

Sexual harassment, solitary confinement, beating, electrocution, and rape threats are tools used by national security officers to force defendants to confess which caused the women mental and physical damages. This raise serious questions around the red lines that Egyptian authorities set in its crackdown on dissent which comes in contradiction with international conventions and Egyptian constitution. As it appears, Egyptian authorities are seeking parity in the violations committed against men and women in the context of its ongoing war against terrorism.



• **The right to legal defence and legal representation**

Every person who is arrested or detained has the right to contact his lawyer after the moment of arrest, this right guaranteed in all national and international conventions of fair trial standards and litigation processes regulations.

UN special rapporteur has expressed concerns regarding the number of cases in which defendants are charged with terrorism crimes while not provided the right to communicate with their lawyers. Concerns were also expressed since lawyers were prevented from accessing case documents until first investigation session was held, and this jeopardized the defendants' rights to prepare for defense .⁴

Nevertheless, after the 12 defendants forcibly disappeared for four months where they were not allowed to communicate their lawyers and were tortured to confess they were brought before the prosecution by the end of January to be interrogated in absence of attorney which is a clear violation of their right to legal representation.

Lawyers complain that national security prosecution prohibited them from accessing case documents which include arrest warrants and investigation records. They were also not allowed to review accusations except verbally which limits their knowledge of the grounds of accusations and the supporting evidence. This jeopardizes the defense of the lawyers before prosecution which consequently infringes the defendants' rights to defend themselves. Also, defendants complain from the intransigence of investigators to prove violations committed



Nada Adel

⁴ Protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism, <http://www.un.org/ga/search/viewdoc.asp?symbol=A/63/223>

against them such as torture, enforced disappearance, and refusal to be referred to forensics.

These are the regular and systematic patterns of violations adopted by Egyptian authorities against dissenting voices of both men and women. Defendants of both genders are subjected to prolonged enforced disappearance in police stations or National Security headquarters, tortured and subjected to physical and mental coercion such as beating, electrocution, sexual harassment to extract confession, are interrogated before prosecution in absence of lawyers, and in case attorneys were allowed to attend investigation session, they are prevented from accessing case documents or are just ignored. This in addition to violations manifested in medical negligence of defendants who face health problems on top of which are mental health problems. Aforementioned violations are regarded as grave infringement of the rights of these defendants guaranteed by International conventions, laws and the Egyptian constitution.

2- A scanned copy of the report filed by sister of detainee Nevine Refaay Ahmed Refaay

٢٠١٨/١١/٢٠

شماره ١ صندوق ٧٥٦

المصرية للاتصالات

نحن بيهمة الامر
صورة رسميه لبرقيه

رقم التقرير	٢٢٤-٢٢
المكتب الصادر	قونجرام مصر
المكتب الوارد	العائنه سنترال
نوع الرساله	برقيه
يوم وساعه الاستقبال	١٣:٥٩ ٢٢-١١-٢٠١٨
يوم وساعه البعث	١٣:٥٩ ٢٢-١١-٢٠١٨
الرقم الاصلى للبرقيه	٢٥٩١٤٢٤٥٨
الرقم التتابعى	٤١٨٠٩٧٣٨٥
رقم المستند	٤١٨٠٩٧٣٨٥
رقم المحاسبه	٠٠٢٢٣٥٨٥٨٢٦
اسم المبلغ	سنترال المعادى ٢
كود الدوله	EG
عدد الكلمات	١٣٢

السيد النائب العام
النائب العام القاهره
العائنه سنترال

تحية طيبه وبعد / اطلب إستغاثه إلى سيادتكم بشأن إختفاء شقيقاتى نغمين رفاعى أحمد رفاعى رقم قومى / ٢٧٤٠٤٢٩٠١٠٣٠٢٤ عند خروجها من المنزل لزياره عائليه عصر يوم ٢٨ سبتمبر ٢٠١٨ وبعد خروجها بقليل تم أخذ زوجها من المنزل سيف الدين حسن محمد على رقم قومى / ٢٧٧١١٠١٠١٠٣٠٥٩ ولم يتم العثور عليهم فى أى قسم شرطه أو مستشفى وحيث أنهم لديهم طفلين صغيرين حمزه سيف الدين والحسن سيف الدين وعمرهم ١٣ سنه وعشر سنوات وليس لديهم من يعولهم وهم بلا مأواه ومتقربين عن مدارسهم من ذلك الوقت وحرصا على مستقبل هؤلاء الأطفال نرجوا من سيادتكم التكرم بالتحرى والبحث عنهم ومعرفة أماكنهم . ولكم جزيل الشكر

مقدمه الطالب / دعاء رفاعى أحمد رفاعى

عنوان الراسل: ١١ شارع ٦٨ بالمعادى قومى / ٠١٤٢١٢٩٨٩٨ / موبايل / ٢٦٨٠٥٠٧٠١٠٢٩٨٢

3- Names of most detainees in the case no. 277 for the year 2019, National Security

	Name	Date of prosecution investigation
1	Aya Ashraf Mohamed elSayed	27 January 2019
2	Abeer Nagy Abdullah	27 January 2019
3	Hend Mohamed Talaat	27 January 2019
4	Zeinab Mohamed hassanen	26 January 2019
5	Heba Mostafa abd elHameed Mohamed	27 January 2019
6	Fatma Gamal Hamed	27 January 2019
7	Mai Yehia Mohamed Azzam	27 January 2019
8	Hala Ismail Mohamed	26 January 2019
9	Iman Mahfouz Hosni Ahmed	26 January 2019
10	Nada Adel Mohamed Mohamed Morsi	28 January 2019
11	Shaimaa Hussein Gomaa	28 January 2019
12	Nevine Refa'y Ahmed Refa'y	26 January 2019
13	Samia Gaber Ouise	28 January 2018
14	Ahmed Abu elKheir Mohamed	3 February 2019
15	Mostafa Ismail Ibrahim	3 February 2019
16	Adel abd elAzeez shehata	3 February 2019
17	Mahmoud Sha'ban ghanem	3 February 2019
18	Emda elSayed Mahmoud	3 February 2019
19	Tamer Mohamed AwadAllah	3 February 2019
20	Ahmed Hashem Ibrahim	Second week of February 2019
21	Mohamed abd elFattah Mohamed Hamed	Second week of February 2019
22	Mohamed Ahmed abd elMaqsod	Second week of February 2019
23	Mohamed Ahmed Mahmoud Ibrahim	Second week of February 2019
24	Hassan Mostafa Ibrahim	Second week of February 2019

25	Mohamed Metwally abd elMoneim	Second week of February 2019
26	Mohamed abd elAl Ali salem	Second week of February 2019
27	Mahmoud abd elSattar	Second week of February 2019
28	Yehia Hussein abd elHady	30 January 2019
29	Mohamed Mostafa Mohamed Faheem	Second week of February 2019
30	Ahmed Mubarak Othman elSayed	Second week of February 2019
31	Ahmed Mohamed Ahmed hassan	Second week of February 2019
32	Hossan Arabi Mohamed Qasem	Second week of February 2019
33	Amr Mahmoud fathi elSayed	Second week of February 2019
34	Mohamed Ashraf abd elRahman	Second week of February 2019
35	Mohamed Badr Mahdy Nasr allah	Second week of February 2019
36	Mohamed Ahmed Ali Mansour	Second week of February 2019
37	Tamer Gamel Mohamed	Second week of February 2019